

**CFA ARCHAEOLOGY LTD**

November 2003

*Commissioned by National Wind Power Ltd*

This document has been prepared in accordance with CFA standard operating procedures.

Author: Date

Approved by: Date

Draft/Final Report Stage: FINAL

**Author: Tim Neighbour BSc FSA Scot MIFA**  
Editor: George Mudie MA AIFA

**Proposed Windfarm at Ederline**  
**Scoping Study – Cultural Heritage**  
**Report No. 867**

## **CULTURAL HERITAGE**

### **Introduction**

National Wind Power Ltd proposes to construct a windfarm at Ederline, Argyll and Bute (NM 940 020, centred). An Environmental Statement is to be produced to support the planning application for the proposed development. A chapter within that document will consider the likely significant effects on cultural heritage interests of the construction and operation of the proposed windfarm and will identify measures that should be taken to mitigate any predicted adverse effects, where practical. This scoping assessment considers the key cultural heritage issues that are likely to arise during the Environmental Impact Assessment, and identifies the methodologies that will be used to identify baseline conditions and to evaluate the significance of predicted effects of the proposed development upon cultural heritage interests.

The cultural heritage contribution to the Environmental Statement will:

- Identify the cultural heritage baseline;
- Assess the proposed development site in terms of its archaeological and historic environment potential, within the context of relevant legislation and planning policy guidelines;
- Consider the potential and predicted effects of the construction and operation of the development on the baseline cultural heritage resource;
- Propose measures, where appropriate, to mitigate any predicted adverse effects.

### **The Existing Environment**

Cultural heritage resources include Scheduled Ancient Monuments; other archaeological features; listed buildings and other buildings of historic or architectural importance; conservation areas; historic gardens and designed landscapes; and any other sites and landscapes with cultural heritage designations identified in the relevant Structure Plan and Local Plan.

Baseline cultural heritage information has been obtained for nationally important sites from Historic Scotland's on-line databases of Listed Buildings and Scheduled Ancient Monuments (<http://www.historic-scotland.gov.uk>). Historic Scotland and the West of Scotland Archaeology Service (WoSAS) have been consulted during the scoping study regarding cultural heritage issues (letters bound at rear). Formal responses have not been received from these bodies. However, the following informal response has been received:

- Mairi Black, the Development Control Officer at Historic Scotland, has provided digital mapping of all Scheduled Ancient Monuments, Listed Buildings and gardens and designed landscapes within a 10km radius of the Ederline site.

<b>NGR</b>	<b>Site</b>	<b>Designation</b>
NS 0052 9528	Castle Lachlan	SAM; Listed, category A
NN 0309 0316	Auchindrain, Township	Listed, category A
NR 986 974	Crarae	Garden and designed landscape
NM 938 078	Rubha na Fidhle, chapel, settlement and rock carvings, Loch Awe	SAM
NM 889 036	Kilneuair, church and settlement, 1900m E of Ford	SAM
NM 884 013	Glasvaar, cairn 90m SW of	SAM
NM 866 033	Ford, stone setting 270m SW of Ford Hotel	SAM
NM 859 015	Creagantairbh Beag, standing stone at S end of Loch Ederline	SAM
NR 876 955	An Car, standing stone, Lechuary	SAM
NR 986 973	Crarae Lodge, long cairn	SAM
NN 025 000	Furnace, Ironworks	SAM
NM 843 012	Carnasserie Farm, cup-marked rock 360m ENE of	SAM
NS 006 967	Kilbride Island, Chapel of Kilbride & associated structures	SAM
NM 972 110	Loch Awe, Innis Errich, chapel & burial ground	SAM
NM 963 104	Innis Errich, crannog 1100m SW of	SAM
NM 977 105	Barr Mor, dun	SAM
NM 957 098	Loch Awe, Carn Mhic Chealair, crannog	SAM
NR 981 967	Minard Cross, Free Church Manse	SAM
NM 894 007	Glasvaar, cupmarked rock 1200m SE of	SAM
NM 854 036	Dun Chonallaich, fort	SAM
NM 882 039	Kilneuair, crannogs 740m WNW and 260m N of St Columba's Church	SAM
NM 902 044	Fincham, crannog 510m NNE of	SAM
NM 882 013	Glasvaar, cupmarked rocks	SAM
NM 867 025	Ederline, crannog 600m W of	SAM
NM 868 037	Ford, cairn 60m E of Forestry Houses	SAM
NM 868 035	Ford, cist 35m ENE of Ford Hotel	SAM
NM 902 039	Fincham, cairn NE of	SAM
NM 905 042	Fincham, cupmarked rocks 600m NE of	SAM
NM 877 045	Caol Chaorann, tower	SAM
NR 975 951	Brainport Bay, stone alignments and quern quarries	SAM
NM 898 043	Fincham Castle	SAM
NM 878 048	Torran, cross-incised stone 40m E of	SAM
NN 022 003	Lochfyne, gunpowder-works, Furnace	SAM
NM 860 015	Stroneskar, cupmarked rock and cairns W of	SAM
NM 867 038	Ford, cupmarked rock, 130m NNW of Forestry Houses	SAM
NM 865 039	Auchinellan, cupmarked rocks and enclosure, 1250m N of	SAM
NM 879 046	Torran, cup-marked rock 290m SSE of	SAM
NM 858 009	Stroneskar, cupmarkings 1750m WSW of	SAM
NM 864 037	Auchinellan, cupmarked rocks 1150m N of	SAM
NM 857 011	Creaganterve Beg, cairns, standing stone and farmstead 550m SSW of	SAM
NS 010 951	Kilmorie Church, burial ground and cross, 450m SW of Castle Lachlan	SAM
NM 880 047	Dun Toiseach, dun 300m SE of Torran Farm	Proposed SAM
NR 922 930	Dun, 260m E of Loch Glashan	Proposed SAM

*Table 1 – Summary list of nationally important cultural heritage feature within a 10km radius of Ederline: Scheduled Ancient Monuments (SAMs), Category A listed buildings and gardens and designed landscapes.*

The Historic Scotland data indicates that no Scheduled Ancient Monuments or listed buildings will be directly affected by the proposed development. The very nature of the site location indicates that it will not lie within a conservation area. There are no Scheduled Ancient Monuments, listed buildings or designated historic gardens or designed landscapes within the windfarm site. Thirty-nine Scheduled Ancient Monuments (SAMs), one of which is also a category A listed building; one further category A listed building; and one garden and designed landscape lies within a 10km radius of the proposed development (Table 1).

The NMRS lists one site within the area of the proposed development: a group of possible shieling huts (NMRS No: NM90SW 11) on the northern side of Fincharn Loch. This site lies on the northern boundary of the area at NM 9318 0392 and is unlikely to be affected by the development.

### **Legislative Background**

The cultural heritage study will be conducted with reference to the following key legislative and planning frameworks:

#### *Legislation*

- Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Areas Act 1979
- Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997
- Town and Country Planning (General Development Procedure) (Scotland) Order 1992

#### *National Planning Policy*

- National Planning Policy Guideline 5, Archaeology and Planning (NPPG 5)
- National Planning Policy Guideline 18, Planning and the Historic Environment (NPPG 18)
- Planning Advice Note 42, Archaeology (PAN 42)

#### *Regional and Local Planning Policy*

- Argyll and Bute Structure Plan, Finalised Plan, September 2001
- Mid Argyll Local Plan, December 1993

#### *Guidance*

- Memorandum of Guidance on Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas (Memorandum)
- An Inventory of Gardens and Designed Landscapes (Inventory)

## **Baseline Conditions**

The collation of baseline information will be conducted according to CFA's standard methodology for EIA projects, and will fulfil the relevant Institute of Field Archaeologists' Standards. The principal methods will comprise archival and documentary research, consultation with interested parties, and reconnaissance field survey.

### *Desk-based Assessment and Consultations*

An assessment will be made of the records held by the National Monuments Record of Scotland (NMRS) and the WoSAS Sites and Monuments Record (SMR). These sources will provide baseline information on archaeological sites and monuments previously recorded both within and in the vicinity of the study area. Aerial photographic records for known sites and monuments will be checked. Relevant documentary sources indicated from these archives will be followed up.

Information will be obtained from appropriate sources on the locations and extents of any sites with statutory and non-statutory designations either within or close to the proposed sites. Data will be collected on Scheduled Ancient Monuments, listed buildings, conservation areas, and gardens and designed landscapes from Historic Scotland, the local authority and others, as appropriate. The relevant Historic Scotland Casework Inspectors will be contacted to ensure that information about the legal status of any identified monuments is up-to-date. Even if there are no such features within the study area, the presence of designated sites elsewhere in the vicinity may be of cultural heritage significance as potential indirect, visual impacts will need to be assessed.

An examination of Ordnance Survey First Edition 6" map coverage will be made, together with any other readily available cartographic information on pre-recent land use in the areas. Information held by the NMRS, the National Library of Scotland and the National Archive of Scotland will be assessed.

An assessment will be made of the available vertical aerial photographic record held by the Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Scotland (RCAHMS). This may reveal the presence of hitherto unidentified sites and sites with low relief not readily visible on the ground.

Bibliographic and documentary sources will be sought to provide background information on the study area, and these may provide additional information on the cultural heritage resource. Consultations with national and local archives and museums will define the presence and location of useful source material. Institutions to be consulted may include the National Archive of Scotland and the National Library of Scotland. The local authority archaeologist will be consulted in the first instance for advice on appropriate local sources of information. Consideration will be given to any specific cultural associations that the area may have, for example in terms of literature or paintings.

### *Reconnaissance Field Survey*

A reconnaissance field survey will be undertaken of the proposed development area. This fieldwork will be conducted to assess any information previously obtained, to identify the extent and condition of any visible archaeological monuments, and to assess the topography and geomorphology of the proposed development area. Key receptors outside the proposed development area will be visited to assess potential indirect effects. It will be timed to occur when ground conditions are suitable (ie avoiding seasons of snow cover, which will hinder identification of remains within the proposed development area, and mist/fog, which will hinder the assessment of indirect, visual effects). This will provide information on the archaeological potential of the area. Sites will be plotted accurately using GPS, local landmarks and tapes as appropriate onto base plans. Written descriptions, scale sketch plans and photographic records will be made of all sites located within the study corridor.

Depending upon the results of desk-based work and initial field prospection, additional work may be required on the remains identified, including more detailed mapping of sites. However, an instrument survey will not be conducted at this stage as we regard this as being more appropriate to any work required as part of the mitigation stage, following planning consent being obtained.

### **Impact Assessment Methodology**

The type of effects of the proposed development on cultural heritage interests will be assessed in the following categories:

- *Direct*, where there may be a physical effect on a site caused by the development. Direct effects tend to have permanent and irreversible adverse effects upon cultural heritage remains.
- *Indirect*, where the setting of a site may be affected.
- *Uncertain*, where there is a risk that the works may impinge on a site, for example where it is not clear where the location or boundaries of a site lie, or where the precise nature of development works is not known.

Effects will be assessed in terms of their magnitude (see below), longevity (permanent / temporary; short-term, medium-term, long-term), reversibility, and nature (adverse / beneficial). Secondary and cumulative impacts will also be considered.

The assessment of significance of predicted effects of the proposed development on individual cultural heritage receptors will be undertaken using two key criteria: sensitivity of receptor and magnitude of effect.

- In assessing the sensitivity of receptor, the importance of cultural heritage resources will be assessed principally according to the criteria published in NPPG5 (for archaeological sites) and the *Memorandum of Guidance on Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas 1998* (for listed buildings). The main thresholds of archaeological importance proposed in NPPG5 are National Importance, Regional and Local Importance, and lesser Importance. The Memorandum states that Category A listed buildings are of national or

international importance, Category B buildings are of regional or more than local importance, and Category C(s) structures are of local importance.

- Magnitudes of effect will be assessed in the categories negligible, minor, moderate or major. Negligible effects have no discernible impact on a site, and equate to the “no change” situation. Minor effects are detectable but do not alter the baseline condition of the topic in question materially. Moderate effects alter the baseline condition of the topic in question materially but not fundamentally. Major effects fundamentally alter the baseline condition of the topic in question.

For cultural heritage sites of lesser importance, all changes to baseline conditions will be considered to be *not significant*. For sites of Regional and Local importance, moderate and major changes to baseline conditions will be considered to be significant effects. For sites of National importance, all but negligible changes to baseline conditions will be considered to be significant effects.

18 November 2003

Our ref: EDER/CN/02

Carol Swanson  
West of Scotland Archaeology Service  
Charing Cross Complex  
20 India Street  
Glasgow  
G2 4PF

Dear Carol

**Ederline Windfarm  
Scoping Study – Cultural Heritage**

I write to request cultural heritage information regarding a proposed windfarm development at Ederline, Argyll and Bute (NGR: NM 940 020 centred: see enclosed map).

CFA has been appointed by National Wind Power Ltd to advise them on cultural heritage issues as an input to a Scoping Report to be prepared as part of the Environmental Impact Assessment process.

Specifically the following information would be useful:

- Details of known archaeological sites and monuments, listed buildings and conservation areas, and historic gardens and designed landscapes within the study Area, and information on where up-to-date schedules of such information are published or may otherwise be consulted (eg Structure Plans, Local Plans).
- Details of cultural heritage sites in the vicinity of the proposed development site which you consider may raise significant issues within the EIA process for this development.
- Information of any current or recent archaeological work or projects being undertaken within the Study Area or in the vicinity, the results of which may not yet be recorded in the National Monuments Record for Scotland.
- Any other comments you may have about the archaeological potential of the Study Area, and your consideration of the key cultural heritage issues within your remit raised by this proposed development.
- Contact details for any further organisations which you would recommend are consulted at this scoping stage. A request for cultural heritage information and opinions has also been sent to Historic Scotland.

I would be grateful if you could respond to the above matters, if possible by next week. An email would be sufficient.

Should you have any questions regarding this matter, please do not hesitate to contact me.

I would be grateful if you would treat the enclosed information in confidence.

Yours sincerely

Tim Neighbour

18 November 2003

Our ref: EDER/CN/03

Mrs Pam Wood  
Historic Scotland  
Longmore House  
Salisbury Place  
Edinburgh  
EH9 1SH

Dear Mrs Wood

**Ederline Windfarm  
Scoping Study – Cultural Heritage**

I write to request cultural heritage information regarding a proposed windfarm development at Ederline, Argyll and Bute (NGR: NM 940 020 centred: see enclosed map).

CFA has been appointed by National Wind Power Ltd to advise them on cultural heritage issues as an input to a Scoping Report to be prepared as part of the Environmental Impact Assessment process.

Therefore, we are writing to you to request any cultural heritage information in your possession which may be relevant to this process.

Specifically the following information would be useful to us:

- Details on any scheduled ancient monuments, and historic gardens and designed landscapes within the study area and in its vicinity, which will require to be considered within the EIA process.
- If available, details of any forthcoming schedulings.
- Any other comments you may have about the archaeological potential of the study area and the key cultural heritage issues within Historic Scotland's remit likely to be raised by the study.
- Contact details for any further organisations which you would recommend are consulted at this scoping stage. A request for cultural heritage information has also been sent to WoSAS.

I would be grateful if you could respond to the above matters, if possible by the end of November 2003.

Should you have any questions regarding this matter, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Yours sincerely

Tim Neighbour